

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
EASTERN DISTRICT OF WISCONSIN

---

ALVIN BALDUS, CINDY BARBERA, CARLENE  
BECHEN, RONALD BIENDSEIL, RON BOONE, VERA  
BOONE, ELVIRA BUMPUS, EVANJELINA  
CLEEREMAN, SHEILA COCHRAN, LESLIE W.  
DAVIS III, BRETT ECKSTEIN, MAXINE HOUGH,  
CLARENCE JOHNSON, RICHARD KRESBACH,  
RICHARD LANGE, GLADYS MANZANET,  
ROCHELLE MOORE, AMY RISSEEUW, JUDY  
ROBSON, GLORIA ROGERS, JEANNE SANCHEZ-  
BELL, CECELIA SCHLIEPP, TRAVIS THYSSEN,

Plaintiffs,

TAMMY BALDWIN, GWENDOLYNNE MOORE  
and RONALD KIND,

Intervenor-Plaintiffs,

v.

Members of the Wisconsin Government Accountability  
Board, each only in his official capacity:  
MICHAEL BRENNAN, DAVID DEININGER, GERALD  
NICHOL, THOMAS CANE, THOMAS BARLAND, and  
TIMOTHY VOCKE, and KEVIN KENNEDY, Director  
and General Counsel  
for the Wisconsin Government Accountability Board,

Defendants,

F. JAMES SENSENBRENNER, JR., THOMAS E. PETRI,  
PAUL D. RYAN, JR., REID J. RIBBLE,  
and SEAN P. DUFFY,

Intervenor-Defendants,

(caption continued on next page)

Civil Action  
File No. 11-CV-562

Three-judge panel  
28 U.S.C. § 2284

---

**PLAINTIFFS' AND INTERVENOR-PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSITION TO  
MOTION TO DISMISS FOR LACK OF STANDING ALL REMAINING CLAIMS  
AS TO 2011 WISCONSIN ACT 44**

---

---

VOCES DE LA FRONTERA, INC., RAMIRO VARA,  
OLGA VARA, JOSE PEREZ, and ERICA RAMIREZ,

Plaintiffs,

v.

Case No. 11-CV-1011  
JPS-DPW-RMD

Members of the Wisconsin Government Accountability  
Board, each only in his official capacity:  
MICHAEL BRENNAN, DAVID DEININGER, GERALD  
NICHOL, THOMAS CANE, THOMAS BARLAND, and  
TIMOTHY VOCKE, and KEVIN KENNEDY, Director  
and General Counsel for the Wisconsin Government  
Accountability Board,

Defendants.

---

The Intervenor-Plaintiffs have the same standing as any other citizen of Wisconsin to challenge the constitutionality of Act 44. It is true that members of Congress “have no entitlement to their current offices.” Mot. (Dkt. 198) at 2. Indeed, the Baldus plaintiffs made this precise point back in November in opposing any intervention by the congressional representatives: “Plaintiffs . . . stipulate . . . that the movants have an interest [in this litigation]—no less and no more an interest, however, than any other citizen. There is no property right in a congressional seat, nor any constitutionally-protected interest in political advantage or success.” Opp’n to Mot. to Intervene (Dkt. 41) at 3.

That very fact demonstrates why it is the Intervenor-Defendants whose argument is “ludicrous.” Mot. (Dkt. 198) at 3. Even assuming that they cannot have been harmed because “they represent themselves” (a position no plaintiffs endorse), members of Congress do not—as the Intervenor-Defendants point out—have any entitlement to their seats. They will not always be in Congress. But for now, as representatives, they are harmed because the lack of core retention and compactness, and the fracturing of communities of interest, diminishes their ability

to fulfill their duties. And if a congressional seat cannot confer standing, it certainly does not eliminate one's standing as a citizen.

The Baldus plaintiffs stipulated to dismiss their Act 44 claims in the interest of judicial economy, with the caveat that they were not speaking on behalf of the Intervenor-Plaintiffs, and the understanding that the Intervenor-Plaintiffs intended to continue pursuing these claims. The Intervenor-Plaintiffs continue to have standing to assert their Act 44 claims. To the extent the Court disagrees, the Baldus plaintiffs withdraw that stipulation.

Dated: February 24, 2012.

GODFREY & KAHN, S.C.

By: s/ Douglas M. Poland  
Douglas M. Poland  
State Bar No. 1055189  
Dustin B. Brown  
State Bar No. 1086277  
One East Main Street, Suite 500  
P.O. Box 2719  
Madison, WI 53701-2719  
608-257-3911  
dpoland@gklaw.com  
dbrown@gklaw.com  
  
*Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

Dated: February 24, 2012.

LAWTON & CATES, S.C.

By: s/ P. Scott Hassett  
P. Scott Hassett  
State Bar No. 1013921  
10 E. Doty Street, Suite 400  
P.O. Box 2965  
Madison, WI 53701-2965  
608-282-6200  
shassett@lawtoncates.com  
  
*Attorneys for Intervenor-Plaintiffs*

7538373\_1